Literature Dynamics Leadership Development: Bibliometric Analysis to Identify Research Trends

Leonita Siwiyanti¹, Syamsul Hadi Senen²
¹²Management Studies, Faculty of Economics and Business, University of Education Indonesia

ABSTRACT

In today’s digitally modern world, characterized by dynamic business landscapes, effective leadership is crucial and cannot be overstated. Strong, decisive, and capable leaders are crucial in overcoming obstacles and complexity related to the company’s 5.0 dynamic. The purpose of this study is to investigate the current state of leadership research by focusing on factors that significantly affect leadership. Motivated by the need to create a comprehensive body of literature on peer pressure, this study used a bibliometric approach, identifying 163 studies using the terms “leadership development” and “strong leadership” from the Scopus database. The most frequently reviewed articles are analyzed to highlight key contributions and provide general information about this field. All of the aforementioned information covers several aspects such as the relationship between managers and employees, manager characteristics, and strong management influence on employees’ work and creativity. The practical implications of this research have the potential to serve as a valuable reference for researchers and practitioners, assisting in the development of clear and concise conclusions with the relevant context. Organizations should be encouraged to integrate their internal processes with the results of their bibliometric analysis. This study highlights the importance of leadership in managing business ventures and daily operations, as well as providing insights into the current state of research and the role of researchers in developing critical understanding of leadership.

Keywords:
Leadership
Strong Leaders
Bibliometric Literature Review

1. INTRODUCTION

Companies should pay attention to leadership because strong companies usually have great leaders. Leaders, especially in the 5.0 era, must keep up with digitization so that they do not fall behind competitors [1].

Being a leader is not as easy as getting a degree or a position. A new man can be called a leader when he can lead with justice and authority [2], [3]. In addition, leaders must have the necessary competence to carry out strong leadership that can easily change teams or take companies forward. In other words, one must have the characteristics of a leader in order to lead well [4], [5].

Corporate leaders and employees often have limited relationships. Because there are boundaries that the employee cannot
break, there is a gap between the leader and the staff member [6]. A leader is usually someone who has the ability to lead, control, and influence one's behavior, thoughts, and feelings [7]–[9].

It shows that leaders have a responsibility to encourage other individuals or groups to certain goals. It's because everything we have, whether it's wealth, work, or children, is a gift from God that we should preserve and use as best we can. Strong leadership means being able to carry out tasks with responsibility, confidence, and professionalism [10]–[12].

However, leadership is a process that requires responsibility to guide, control, and influence the thoughts, feelings, and behavior of a person or group in order to a desired goal; it will lead the individual or group to a better direction and always be on the path of truth [8], [13], [14].

If the leadership given by a person is considered strong because of the various values inherent to it, for example, the members led can follow the rules made by them, then that leadership is considered to be strong. The strong concept of leadership is not a concept developed by a particular individual or philosopher [15], [16].

To be able to ensure that each team member maximizes their potential and does their best work. A leader can challenge, motivate, and inspire. Working with a strong leader will provide an opportunity for members to communicate well, learn to solve problems, and create a creative team [17]–[19].

For an organization to succeed, leadership is crucial. A bibliometric approach can help in terms of leadership development because it can provide a useful understanding of research trends [20]. The topics that are most discussed, and the role that researchers play in leadership development. This study aims to trace the tracks of research on difficult leadership. The aim of this research, conducted using a bibliometric approach, is to gain a better understanding of the progress in current leadership studies as well as the factors that influence difficult leadership [21], [22].

For example, a study conducted at Al-Futuh Tikung Lamongan on the importance of student organization in building leadership character from a Gibson theory perspective emphasizes how important student organization is [23]. In addition, research has been carried out on the development of leadership from an Islamic perspective. For example, research on development of the leadership of the head of school for the improvement of the quality of education and development of HMI leadership for lifelong learning [24], [25].

With all the research that has been done, the issue that emerges is how the trend in leadership research has evolved over time? What are the topics most discussed in literature related to leadership? Through a literary map of robust leadership, it is expected to provide a comprehensive overview of trends and progress in leadership studies. Moreover, it is hoped that a bibliometric approach can help identify current research trends, topics that are most discussed, and researchers' contributions to developing robust leaders' studies.

2. METHODS

In this study, the bibliometric analysis method was used. The searched keywords were identified, preliminary search results, refinement of search results, preliminary statistical compilation, and data analysis were used in this study [26], [27]. Some literature states that bibliometric analysis is conducted in five steps [27]–[29] as presented in Figure 1.
Figure 1: Five Stages of Bibliometric Analysis

Source:[28]

And here are the steps of the five stages of bibliometric analysis.

1. **Determination of keywords.** Keyword selection in November 2023, literature was searched with the keywords "leadership development" and "strong leadership". Both the Publish or Perish (PoP) program and the Scopus (Sc) database were used. The choice of Publish or Perish was made because it has proven to be quite effective in searching current articles [12], [30]. Scopus is a popular and easily accessible database of international scientific papers today.

2. **Initial Search Results:** "Keyword" was used to conduct the initial search, and the number of articles using the keyword was limited to 1000 from 2013 to 2023. A total of 645 findings were found and stored in the form of a Research Information System (RIS), which contains information such as title, author, affiliation, abstract, keywords, and references.

3. **Improvements in search.** From the 645 data in the Sc database, appropriate and indexed articles were selected. We found only 163 appropriate articles from the journal data-not including newspapers, books, book reviews, or book chapters. The corrected data were then saved as RIS files, and the RIS data were imported into Mendeley bibliographic software.

4. **Compile preliminary data.** The aim is to ensure that all elements involved in the journal article, such as publication year, volume, number, and pages, are present in the updated data.

Data analysis. This study used the PoP program to collect bibliographic data; however, VoS Viewer was used to view and analyze the bibliometric network and produced interesting visual results and analysis. In addition, ViosViewer can use co-citation networks and keyword maps to create author, publication, and journal maps.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Publications and citations

The previous PoP data search results consisted of 645 articles from the Scopus database; after refinement, 163 suitable articles were found through a thorough review of the 645 articles. The following table shows the difference in data matrices from the initial search results and after refinement.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1. Matrix Comparison</th>
<th>Data Matrix</th>
<th>Initial Search Result</th>
<th>Improved Search Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Source</td>
<td></td>
<td>2013-2023</td>
<td>2013-2023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year of Publication</td>
<td></td>
<td>645</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document</td>
<td></td>
<td>94923</td>
<td>3674</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation</td>
<td></td>
<td>9492.30</td>
<td>3674.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation/year</td>
<td></td>
<td>189.85</td>
<td>22.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation/document</td>
<td></td>
<td>69260.13</td>
<td>3674.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document/author</td>
<td></td>
<td>280.62</td>
<td>163.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author/document</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.38</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Furthermore, from the 163 articles with the keywords "leadership development" and "strong leadership", the 10 articles with the highest citation value were selected to show the most relevant contributions in this study. The results are presented in the following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Cites</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>Kim Yin Chan, Moon Ho R. Ho, Jeffrey C. Kennedy, Marilyn A. Uy, Bianca N.Y. Kang, Olexander S. Chernyshenko, and Kang Yang T. Yu,</td>
<td>Who wants to be an intrapreneur? Relations between employees' entrepreneurial, professional, and leadership career motivations and intrapreneurial motivation in organizations</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>Frontiers in Psychology</td>
<td>Original Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>Jason C. Pradarelli, Gregory A. Jaffe, Christy Harris</td>
<td>A leadership development</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>Surgery (United States)</td>
<td>Elsevier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Journal</td>
<td>Publisher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Lemak, Michael W., Mulholland, and Justin B. Dimick</td>
<td>Academic leadership Development: First-year participant evaluation</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>Journal of Professional Nursing Development</td>
<td>Elsevier</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Audrey Berman</td>
<td>Experience-Based Leadership Development and Professional Sport Organizations</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>Journal of Sport Management</td>
<td>Human Kinetics Publishers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Stephen Frawley, Daniel Favaloro, and Nico Schuilenkorf</td>
<td>Directly elected mayors in Italy—creating a strong leader doesn't always mean creating strong leadership</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>Public Money and Management</td>
<td>Routledge</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Alessandro Sancino &amp; Lorenzo Castellani</td>
<td>Postdoctoral Nurses’ Experiences with Leadership and Career Development: A Qualitative Study</td>
<td>2019</td>
<td>Journal of Nursing Scholarship</td>
<td>Scopus</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 shows that articles written by Michelle D. Young, Kathleen M. Winn, and Marcy A. Reedy were the most in line with the keywords. 213 citations are the greatest number of citations written by other authors. The article was published in the journal Quarterly Educational Administration published by Sage. With a focus on Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA), this research discusses the critical role of educational leadership in achieving federal goals in education. It also discusses how ESSA addresses leadership development and how states can use this opportunity to strengthen leadership. It also discusses the relationship between practice and ESSA [31].

The study "Leadership and governance in regional tourism" was conducted in 2015 by Flávio Valente, Dianne Dredge, and Gui Lohmann. Utilizing the case study approach to assess the efficacy of regional tourist organizations run by businesses and government. This study indicates that there is not enough data to back up the claim that businesses or governments can more successfully steer the expansion of regional tourism. Moreover, this study suggests that further research is necessary to fully understand the relationship between leadership and governance in regional tourism [32].

Further research was carried out by [33] to examine the connection between innovative climate in firms, psychological empowerment, and transformational leadership. The findings showed that transformational leadership significantly predicted both psychological empowerment and the innovative climate in schools, with psychological empowerment serving as a partial mediating element in this connection. 301 teachers from Eskisehir, Turkey's secondary schools took part in the research [33].

Source: Data processing results (2023)
The effectiveness of Taking Charge of Change (TCC), a 10-month leadership development program, in improving the skills of early childhood education program directors was investigated in a study by Talan et al. [34]. The results showed that directors’ skills and knowledge were enhanced by the TCC program, which enhanced early childhood education programs. Moreover, this study emphasizes the value of leadership development in improving the overall quality of early childhood education.

The purpose of Chan et al.’s [35] study is to ascertain how intrapreneurial motivation in firms relates to individuals’ career aspirations for professionalism, leadership, and entrepreneurship. This study aims to measure employees’ intrapreneurial motivation in addition to their E, P, and L career objectives. The results show that the E, P, and L motives, both singly and together, have an impact on the prediction of intrapreneurial motivation. The study has practical ramifications for businesses looking to encourage employee entrepreneurship.

Additionally, studies on the evaluation of leadership development programs have been done. Gregory A. Jaffe, Christy Harris Lemak, Michael W. Mulholland, Justin B. Dimick, Jason C. Pradarelli, and others (2016) examined the evaluation of a surgeon leadership development program. They examined the benefits and drawbacks of the program as well as how it impacted the surgeon’s development into a medical leader. To find out why they enrolled in the program and what their goals were for completing the course, interviews were done with new participants. The evaluation’s conclusions showed that the program was effective in raising participants’ levels of self-empowerment, self-awareness, and team-building skills, among other leadership abilities. In addition, suggestions for future program improvements were made by the participants. This research can help develop leadership initiatives that are similar [36].

Eight faculty members with the potential to become leaders participated in an academic leadership development program at a nursing faculty, which was the subject of Berman’s research [37]. There was one four-hour program session every quarter. Among the subjects covered in the curriculum were student issues, diversity, politics, budget and governance, legal issues, leadership pathways, and human resources. The study’s findings demonstrated that the program had a positive impact on participants’ leadership abilities and equipped them for responsibilities in the future.

In their research Frawley et al., [38] discuss how leadership development is critical in the highly competitive sports industry, where leadership performance is always under scrutiny and improvement. Significant competitive advantage in sports organizations can come from strong leadership. As a result, greater attention has been paid to leadership and talent development. Using a qualitative case study methodology, this study investigated the characteristics of experiential leadership development practices in three leading professional sports organizations in Australia. The results show that, compared to more formal leadership training, professional sports organizations in Australia place greater emphasis on workforce development through experiential opportunities.

### 3.2 Topic Visualisation Using Vos Viewer

Figure 2 shows the network visualization adjusted with the corrected keywords “leader building” and “strong leadership”, while figure 3 shows the overlay visualization, and figure 4 shows the density visualization.
Figure 2. Topic Area Visualisation using Network Visualisation  
*Source: VOSviewer, 2023*

Each cluster has a specific colour, and several keywords of the same colour can be found in each cluster. In general, the relationship between two circles gets stronger the closer they are to each other.

Table 3 shows the results of the audience VOS extracted from the keywords by full calculation, with 5 as the minimum value of prominence. The results show 1536 terms, 94 of which meet the threshold and the other 94 are verified. The results show that there are six groups, ninety-four items, and 2289 networks with a total network strength of 5973.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster</th>
<th>Keyword (Element) Representing Each Cluster</th>
<th>Colour</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cluster 1 (25 items)</td>
<td>Capacity building (5; case study; community care; community networks; global health; government; health; health care delivery; health care policy; health promotion; health services accessibility; health care system; health education; health policy; health education; implementation; information processing; management; organization and management; policy; policy making; primary health care; public health; sustainability; sustainable development; world health organization. Adult; article; clinical article; clinical competence; curriculum; education; female; health care personnel; health personnel; human experiment; interprofessional relations; male; medical education; middle aged; nurse; nursing education; public relations; qualitative analysis; questionnaire; skill; surveys and questionnaires; teamwork; thematic analysis; United Kingdom. Canada; decision making; evidence based practice; funding; health care planning; health services research; interview; interviews as topic; organization; organizational innovation; priority journal; resource allocation; scientist; semi structured interview; united states.</td>
<td>Red</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cluster 2 (24 items)</td>
<td>Child; controlled study; human; humans; learning</td>
<td>Dark Green</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cluster 3 (16 items)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Dark blue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cluster 4 (15 items)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Light Green</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
However, the year-to-year trend of research related to the selected key is shown in Figure 2. It starts with dark blue, which is a sign of the past; followed by green, and finally yellow, which is a sign of the recent. Organization and management, curriculum, nursing education, community networking, community care, case study, health care planning is some of the leadership development themes, as shown by the dark blue colour in 2015.

Furthermore, at the end of 2016 until the end of 2019, lighter colours are shown so that it can be seen in the figure, namely leadership, human, humans, article, qualitative research, health care quality, sustainability, interpersonal communication, skills. The yellow colour is done from 2019 to the current year 2023. From the overlay visualisation image, it can be seen that the themes include leadership development, personal health, psychology, nursing, implementation, policy, these themes can be used as novelty in research.

In addition, as shown in Figure 3, the depth of research is indicated by colour variations from blue to green and yellow. The yellow colour indicates more research related to the keywords, while the blue colour indicates less research related to the keywords.

Figure 3. Topic Area Visualisation using Overlay Visualisation

Source: VOSviewer, 2023
4. CONCLUSION AND IMPLICATIONS

This study emphasises how important leadership is for a company’s success, especially in the era of digitalisation (era 5.0). For effective leadership, a leader must be fair, decisive, and have the necessary abilities. Although the relationship between leaders and employees is often limited, leaders have the responsibility to motivate and lead the team to achieve their goals. Effective leadership requires professionalism, responsibility, and trustworthiness.

This study discusses various aspects of leadership development, such as leader-employee relationships, characteristics of a leader, and how strong leadership impacts team performance and creativity. The research method used is bibliometric analysis, which concentrates on the terms “leadership development” and “strong leadership”. The results of the analysis provide an overview of current research trends and the role played by researchers in developing leadership studies.

The real implication of this research is to see the importance of leadership in companies to achieve business success, especially in facing the challenges of digitalisation. Leaders must be fair, powerful, and have the necessary capabilities. It helps organisations select and develop leaders through practical guidance.

Furthermore, this study shows that there are limits in the leader-employee relationship and what leaders should do to motivate the team. This research can encourage companies to develop better communication methods for the people they employ.

Bibliometric research shows that leadership development is very important. To create better leadership development programs, organisations can use this data. In addition, this study found that leadership research trends can help researchers and organisations to stay relevant and follow trends.

So, the contribution of the article and related research is that finding the highest-cited articles provides an overview of the most significant research on leadership. For practitioners and researchers interested in this topic, this can be an important reference.

Finally, with this study researchers can make decisions and actions that best suit their situation and goals, organisations should consider the results of this bibliometric analysis in conjunction with their internal context.
REFERENCES


