

Analysis of the Death Penalty in the Context of Human Rights Law

Kadek Arya Putra Gunawan¹, I Nyoman Bagiastra²

¹ Universitas Udayana and kadekaryaputra@gmail.com

² Universitas Udayana and nyoman_bagiastra@unud.ac.id

ABSTRACT

This research explores the implementation of the death penalty in Indonesia in the context of human rights through literature study methods. The fundamental problem lies in legal uncertainty, human rights violations, and social impacts arising from the execution of the death penalty. The purpose of the study is to analyze these complex dynamics with a focus on Indonesian conditions. The literature study method is used to investigate scientific works, human rights reports, and related official documents. The results showed policy changes, non-conformity to human rights standards, as well as shifts in public opinion and international responses. The conclusion of the study underscores the need for more progressive policy measures to ensure fairness, transparency, and protection of individual rights in the execution of the death penalty in Indonesia. The novelty of this research lies in its comprehensive approach to this controversial issue, offering an in-depth and relevant perspective for further understanding.

Keywords: Death Penalty, Human Rights, Indonesia, Legal Policy

1. INTRODUCTION

In the context of human rights, the death penalty, which is the most severe form of punishment in the criminal justice system, has been the topic of arguments that are both complicated and contentious. The use of the death sentence gives rise to a number of difficulties that involve profound ethical and legal considerations[1]. It is important to note that the emphasis placed on human rights concerns has led to an increase in attention, both domestically and globally, particularly in the few decades that have passed[2]. When seen within the context of human rights, the significance of conducting an investigation into the execution of the death sentence becomes readily apparent. Through the consideration of pertinent human rights issues, the purpose of this research is to conduct a more in-depth investigation into the manner in which the death sentence is implemented in Indonesia. It is anticipated that the results of this research will provide light on the effects, difficulties, and possible breaches of human rights that may be brought about by the use of the death sentence[3].

During the process of putting together this study, it is necessary for us to investigate a variety of perspectives on the death sentence, including ethical, moral, and legal viewpoints. In addition, it is essential to pay attention to the historical, cultural, and social background of Indonesia in order to comprehend the dynamics that are behind the introduction of the death sentence[4]. As a result, this research not only contributes to a deeper comprehension of the use of the death sentence in Indonesia, but it also investigates the wider ramifications that are associated with human rights on a worldwide scale[5]. In the context of human rights, it is anticipated that the result of this research will serve as a foundation for a more in-depth discussion on the relevance, efficacy, and accountability of the death penalty[6].

In the framework of human rights study, Indonesia provides case studies that are both intriguing and challenging. This is due to the fact that Indonesia has a lengthy history of the use of the death penalty at various times[7]. When it comes to the fulfillment of human rights norms, the death sentence in Indonesia presents a number of serious obstacles, notably with regard to the

protection of the right to life and the prohibition of cruel, inhuman, or degrading treatment[8]. There is a strong foundation for this research that is provided by the debate that surrounds the policy and implementation of the death sentence in Indonesia[9]. Within the scope of the in-depth examination, several issues, including but not limited to legal, ethical, and social effect factors, will be extensively detailed. In addition, the research will investigate the extent to which political, cultural, and religious factors impact people's perspectives and the actual use of the death sentence[10].

In the framework of human rights, the purpose of this study is to assess the degree to which Indonesia satisfies its international commitments to safeguard the fundamental rights of persons[11]. In addition, the research will emphasize the growth of the death sentence in terms of law, changes in public opinion, as well as measures undertaken by the government to enhance conformity with human rights standards[12]. Therefore, the findings of this research will not only contribute to a more in-depth comprehension of the debate surrounding the use of the death penalty in Indonesia, but they will also offer a significant contribution to the knowledge of the intricate dynamics that influence the execution of the policy within the context of human rights frameworks. At both the national and international levels, it is believed that this approach would allow for the discovery of a way to change the death sentence in a manner that is more in keeping with the ideals of human rights[13].

The purpose of this study is to provide a summary of an in-depth examination of the appropriateness of the death sentence practice in Indonesia in relation to human rights norms that are recognized worldwide. One of the most important aspects of this study is an analysis of the degree to which the death sentence in Indonesia satisfies the requirements of justice, proportionality, and protection of individual rights in line with international human rights standards[14]. Aspects of justice will be examined in order to evaluate the legal and judicial processes that result in the application of the death sentence. Certain aspects of justice will be evaluated, including access to attorneys, openness of court proceedings, and fair treatment of defendants. The principle of proportionality will be brought to the forefront in order to guarantee that the death sentence will only be carried out in specific instances that are in accordance with high standards, therefore minimizing the possibility of misuse or arbitrary application[15].

Furthermore, the findings of this research will contribute to a more in-depth comprehension of the dynamics of public opinion in relation to the death sentence. It discusses the changes that have occurred in public opinion over the course of time, the social and cultural variables that have an effect on people's perspectives, and the ramifications that these developments have had on the policies of the government [16]. Taking this into consideration, the research will investigate the extent to which shifting perspectives of society and the government can have an impact on the policy regarding the death sentence and, more crucially, the degree to which Indonesia complies with human rights norms. By taking this approach, it is hoped that this study will provide a comprehensive picture of the alignment of the practice of the death penalty in Indonesia with international human rights norms. This will be accomplished by providing space for a deeper understanding of the evolution of public opinion and government policies in dealing with this highly controversial issue.

It is anticipated that this research will give profound and helpful insights connected to the difficulty of the application of the death sentence in the context of human rights, particularly in the

multi-dimensional reality of Indonesia. This will be accomplished by providing a detailed account of the background information.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

In the context of human rights law, the death penalty is a contentious issue since it is a sort of criminal sanction that demands a person to lose his life as a punishment for a criminal act that they have done[17]. The use of the death sentence gives rise to a variety of issues concerning human values, justice, and the respect for the right to life[18]. These debates are connected to human rights. The right to life is considered to be a fundamental right in human rights, which is a fundamental concept that acknowledges the inherent value and dignity of every individual[19]. According to this point of view, the death sentence is regarded as a breach of that right since it disregards the human rights values that underpin life and deems every individual to be entitled to life and respect for his dignity.

When considering the social and psychological effects of carrying out the death sentence, many people say that this not only deprives a person of his right to life, but it also deprives him of prospects for rehabilitation and recovery[7]. However, this is not the only implication of the death penalty. Due to the fact that it does not provide the person who committed the crime the chance to change his behavior and become a useful member of society, the death sentence is considered to be a kind of punishment that is of an inhumane character[20]. In addition, the criminal justice system is not without flaws, and there is a significant possibility of making mistakes when it comes to the application of the death sentence. Uncertainty over the law and the possibility of a mistaken identification might result in the death of wrongfully accused persons. As a result, when human rights are taken into consideration, the implementation of the death sentence becomes a significant obstacle that has the potential to do harm to both individuals and society as a whole[21].

On the other side, there are those who advocate for the establishment of the death penalty. These individuals contend that there are some circumstances in which this kind of punishment is required to guarantee the security of society and to serve as a deterrent against those who commit significant offenses. This argument frequently comes into conflict with the ideas of human rights due to the fact that there is a paradoxical relationship between the realization of justice and the maintenance of the right to life[17]. Some nations have limited or eliminated the use of the death penalty in an effort to better conform with human rights standards[22]. This is a reaction to the complexity of the subject that has been brought up. It is generally agreed that alternative applications, such as life sentences without the possibility of release, are a more humanitarian type of punishment since they provide for the possibility of improvement and transformation. From a broader perspective, the clash of values and morality that exists within society is reflected in the problem of the death sentence in relation to human rights[23]. The discussion brought to light the significance of locating possible solutions that are in accordance with the principles of human rights, while at the same time paying attention to issues of public safety and justice.

3. METHODS

In order to investigate scholarly works, human rights reports, and government documents that are associated with the death penalty in Indonesia, this research technique employs a literature study methodology[24]. The major approach that was used was the literature review because it

enables researchers to collect a substantial amount of material from a wide range of sources. This gives them the opportunity to provide a comprehensive account of the historical developments, legal elements, and societal effect of the death sentence in Indonesia. In order to investigate and evaluate material from a variety of sources about the death penalty in relation to human rights, with a particular emphasis on the circumstances that exist in Indonesia, this research makes use of the literature study technique as the primary approach method.

1. **Literature Source Identification:** The first step of the research project will involve the identification of relevant literary sources from a variety of different media. These sources will include scientific journals, textbooks, reports on human rights, official government papers, and news items. There will be a focus on terms that are associated with the death sentence, human rights, and the current situation in Indonesia during this process.
2. **Selection of Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria:** Following the identification of the sources, the research will proceed to construct inclusion and exclusion criteria in order to guarantee the correctness and applicability of the information. The year of publication, the dependability of the source, and a particular emphasis on human rights and the death sentence are some examples of the factors that may be considered.
3. **Categorization of Themes and Aspects of Analysis:** The chosen literary sources will be arranged into categories according to the topics and features of study that have been decided in advance. Aspects of law, ethics, public opinion, alterations in policy, and the societal impact of the death sentence might be included among these issues.
4. **Historical Studies:** It is necessary to do historical research on the evolution of the death penalty in Indonesia in order to have an understanding of the context and dynamics of the underlying changes in the legal system. The research takes into account alterations in legislation, significant events, and societal elements that have an impact on people's attitudes of the death sentence.
5. **Evaluation of Human Rights Standards:** The research will examine the use of the death sentence in Indonesia by adhering to internationally known human rights norms. This evaluation will take place once the classification process has been completed. Within the context of the death sentence, this entails doing a review of the justice, proportionality, and protection of individual rights.
6. **Public and Government Opinion Analysis:** examines the perspectives of both the general population and the government with regard to the death sentence. An analytical approach to shifting public opinions, the government's response to foreign criticism, and other elements that influence Indonesia's policy toward the death sentence are all included in this report.
7. **Synergy of Literature Findings:** The purpose of this paper is to offer a comprehensive knowledge of the application of the death sentence in Indonesia within the framework of human rights by providing a summary of the findings of the pertinent literature and identifying patterns or consistent findings in the research findings.

The use of this approach of literature study will give a strong basis for examining this complicated subject and will provide the in-depth insights that are required to address research questions linked to the death sentence within the context of human rights in Indonesia.

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The method of applied literature study was utilized in this research project, which resulted in the discovery of a number of key results about the application of the death sentence in Indonesia with regard to human rights.

1. **Historical Death Penalty in Indonesia:** Since Indonesia gained its independence, the growth of the death sentence in the country has been the subject of research that focuses on historical studies. Based on the findings of the investigation, it was discovered that the regulation and application of the death sentence have been subject to modifications throughout the course of time and in response to shifts in government policy[25].
2. **Uncertainty of Law and Justice:** There is a lack of clarity on the application of law and justice in Indonesia with regard to the death sentence, according to the results of the literature. There are a number of reasons to be concerned about the fairness of the death sentence, including the existence of judicial voids, the absence of well-defined criteria, and the presence of components that are discriminatory in the prosecution process[12].
3. **Human Rights Standards:** The assessment of human rights standards reveals a number of transgressions that are of substantial importance. A number of issues have been raised, including concerns regarding inhuman and humiliating treatment, as well as queries concerning the right to life and the right not to be tortured, which have not been completely satisfied[25].
4. **Public and Government Opinion:** Analysis of public opinion and government shows a shift in views towards the death penalty. While some sectors of society support its use as an effective form of punishment, there is also increased awareness of the potential for abuse and its negative consequences on human rights[26].
5. **Social Impact:** The social impact of the death sentence is identified through a literature review. This includes the psychological impact that the death penalty has on the families of convicted individuals, the possibility for increasing levels of violence, and the contributions that may be made to cycles of poverty and social inequality[27].
6. **International Response:** The findings of this research provide insight on the reactions of the world community to the execution of the death sentence in Indonesia. Changing worldwide perspectives on the death penalty, as well as pressure from the international community and human rights groups, have all had a significant influence in shaping both legislation and practice at the national level[16].
7. **Recommendations and Future Paths:** The conclusion of the research, which is based on these findings, includes some suggestions on how the administration of the death sentence in Indonesia may be significantly improved. In the context of the execution of the death sentence, these proposals include the modification of policies, the enhancement of transparency, and the implementation of further measures to guarantee the protection of human rights.

As a result, the findings of this research provide a significant addition to a more in-depth comprehension of the connection that exists between the death sentence and human rights in Indonesia. It is anticipated that these results will serve as a foundation for additional debate and policy adjustments in the future that will enable more effective protections for human rights.

The results of this study provide in-depth conclusions concerning the use of the death sentence in Indonesia with regard to the protection of human rights. Variations in rules and administration of the death sentence in Indonesia have occurred throughout the country's history, reflecting the complex dynamics that have occurred throughout time[28]. Uncertainty over the law and justice continues to be a key problem, despite the fact that the government has made a number of modifications in its policy addressing the death sentence. Vacancies in the judicial system and the absence of well-defined guidelines for the execution of the death penalty both contribute to the existence of circumstances in which individual rights may be disregarded[22]. There are inconsistencies in the use of the death penalty in Indonesia, according to an analysis of human rights standards. There was a need for a review of the practice of the death sentence within the framework of conformity with internationally recognized human rights standards[29]. This was demonstrated

by the fact that violations of the right to life and the right not to be tortured or persecuted were focus points. This is made even more complicated by the fact that these rights are not always provided in their entirety, which raises significant problems regarding the preservation of individual protections for human rights.

The importance of involving public and government opinion in this discussion cannot be ignored. There is a shift in views that reflects the complex dynamics of Indonesian society towards the death penalty[30]. In spite of the fact that there is widespread support for its utilization as an efficient form of punishment, there is also a rising awareness of the possibility of abuse and the adverse effects to human rights. As a result, it is essential to acknowledge that these viewpoints have the potential to affect the modifications of policies at the national point of reference. In the case of Indonesia, another issue of concern is the adverse effects that the death sentence has on society[31]. Psychological implications on families of convicts, increased rates of violence, and contributions to cycles of poverty and social inequality are factors to consider in policy discussions[32]. A deep understanding of these social impacts can help design more holistic and sustainable policies, minimizing negative risks to society.

The international response to the implementation of the death penalty in Indonesia also needs to be scrutinized. Pressure from the international community and human rights organizations has given impetus to change, demonstrating the importance of global cooperation in promoting human rights principles[33]. Therefore, Indonesia needs to consider international responses as part of future evaluations and policy changes.

In closing, these findings indicate the need for changes in policies and practices related to the death penalty in Indonesia. Recommendations to improve fairness, transparency, and human rights protections need to be integrated into policy debates. Through these measures, it is hoped that Indonesia can steer its criminal justice system and death penalty policy towards a direction that is more aligned with globally recognized human rights standards, creating a more just and sustainable legal environment.

CONCLUSION

With the use of literature study techniques, this research provides an in-depth analysis of the application of the death sentence in Indonesia, taking into account the country's human rights situation. According to the findings, there are a number of important issues, some of which include legal ambiguity, violations of human rights, and severe societal repercussions respectively. The complicated dynamics of the death sentence in Indonesia are illustrated by the answers expressed by the international community and the public opinion. Therefore, in order to guarantee justice, transparency, and the preservation of individual rights in the execution of the death sentence, policy measures that are more progressive and based on human rights are required. Based on these findings, it is imperative that Indonesia's legal system undergoes a comprehensive examination and undergoes a positive adjustment in order to conform to the human rights standards that are recognized globally.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS



I would like to express my sincere gratitude to all those who have participated in this research. I would also like to thank the institutions and libraries that provided access to the various literature and documentation resources that supported this research. Their contribution is very meaningful in producing comprehensive and accurate analysis.

REFERENCES

- [1] S. Sumardin, O. S. Matompo, and I. Lestiawati, "Tinjauan Yuridis Penyalahgunaan Narkotika Di Dalam Lembaga Pemasyarakatan (Lapas) Oleh Narapidana Yang Telah Divonis Hukuman Mati," *Jurnal Kolaboratif Sains*, vol. 2, no. 1, 2019.
- [2] C. M. Cerna, "Universality of human rights: The case of the death penalty," *ILSA J. Int'l & Comp. L.*, vol. 3, p. 465, 1996.
- [3] M. D. Mathias, "The sacralization of the individual: Human rights and the abolition of the death penalty," *American Journal of Sociology*, vol. 118, no. 5, pp. 1246–1283, 2013.
- [4] H. Purbanto and B. Hidayat, "Systematic Literature Review: Penyalahgunaan Narkoba di Kalangan Remaja dalam Perspektif Psikologi dan Islam," *Al-Hikmah: Jurnal Agama dan Ilmu Pengetahuan*, vol. 20, no. 1, pp. 1–13, 2023.
- [5] C. A. Short, "The Abolition of the Death Penalty: Does Abolition Really Mean What You Think It Means," *Ind. J. Global Legal Stud.*, vol. 6, p. 721, 1998.
- [6] P. M. Maduna, "The death penalty and human rights," *South African journal on human rights*, vol. 12, no. 2, pp. 193–213, 1996.
- [7] B. Dunér and H. Geurtsen, "The death penalty and war," *The International Journal of Human Rights*, vol. 6, no. 4, pp. 1–28, 2002.
- [8] M. G. Schmidt, "Universality of Human Rights and the Death Penalty-The Approach of the Human Rights Committee," *ILSA J. Int'l & Comp. L.*, vol. 3, p. 477, 1996.
- [9] F. Fadhlurrahman, T. Y. Falikah, Z. Nuryana, R. A. Nur Ihsan, A. K. Putri, and R. Roihanah, "Concept of Islamic Character Education According to The Thoughts of Khalid Bin Hamid Al-Hazami And Hasyim Ali Al-Ahdal," *At-Ta'dib*, vol. 17, no. 2, p. 254, 2022, doi: 10.21111/at-tadib.v17i2.8808.
- [10] O. Yanto, "Death Penalty Execution and the Right to Life in Perspective of Human Rights, 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia, and Indonesian Law," *Yustisia Jurnal Hukum*, vol. 5, no. 3, pp. 643–662, 2016.
- [11] F. S. Siagian, N. Putra, and M. K. Imam, "Kajian Yuridis Tindak Pidana Penanam Ganja Berdasarkan Undang-undang Tentang Narkotika Indonesia," *Neoclassical Legal Review: Journal of Law and Contemporary Issues*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 1–10, 2023.
- [12] K. D. A. Putri and R. Arifin, "Tinjauan Teoritis Keadilan dan Kepastian dalam Hukum di Indonesia (The Theoretical Review of Justice and Legal Certainty in Indonesia)," *Mimbar Yustitia*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 142–158, 2018.
- [13] A. P. Sofyan and Z. Suleman, "Eksistensi Hukum Adat dalam Kompilasi Hukum Islam Indonesia (KHI)," *Al-Adalah*, vol. 13, no. 2, pp. 165–178, 2017.
- [14] A. N. Bishop, "The Death Penalty in the United States: An International Human Rights Perspective," *S. Tex. L. Rev.*, vol. 43, p. 1115, 2001.
- [15] C. Wulandari, "CRITICAL REVIEW TOWARD THE FILING OF LEGAL EFFORT FOR THE CONVITS OF DEATH PENALTY BEFORE EXECUTION PROCESS IN INDONESIA".
- [16] K. Leba, Y. Endi, B. Watunglawar, and F. A. Ranubaya, "The Death Penalty In Indonesia: A Theological Perspective of Law," *International Journal of Indonesian Philosophy & Theology*, vol. 4, no. 1, pp. 1–15, 2023.
- [17] E. Neumayer, "Death penalty: The political foundations of the global trend towards abolition," *Human rights review*, vol. 9, pp. 241–268, 2008.
- [18] A. N. M. Utami and S. Indarjo, "Strategi Penanggulangan Kasus Positif COVID-19 di Asia Tenggara: Systematic Review," *HIGEIA (Journal of Public Health Research and Development)*, vol. 7, no. 3, pp. 322–333, 2023.
- [19] B. Sipayung, J. Ibrani, and H. W. Lubis, "Performa Profesi Advokat sebagai Officium Nobile menurut Pandangan Netizen (Studi Kasus Sdr. RAN)," *Eksekusi: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum Dan Administrasi Negara*, vol. 1, no. 3, pp. 263–275, 2023.
- [20] I. C. Purnomo and G. Suharto, "Vaksinasi SARS-CoV-2 dalam Perspektif Hukum di Indonesia," *Cermin Dunia Kedokteran*, vol. 48, no. 9, pp. 353–358, 2021.
- [21] D. D. Turangan, E. V. T. Senewe, W. J. Kumendong, and J. Sondakh, "The Right to Life Based on Human Rights Principles: A Normative Study of the Death Penalty in Indonesia," *Journal of The Community Development in Asia*, vol. 4, no. 2, pp. 85–95, 2021.
- [22] W. Schabas, *The abolition of the death penalty in international law*. Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- [23] W. A. Schabas, "International law and abolition of the death penalty," *Wash. & Lee L. Rev.*, vol. 55, p. 797, 1998.
- [24] Sugiyono, *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta, 2016.
- [25] B. Sipayung, S. O. Manullang, and H. K. Siburian, "Penerapan Hukuman Mati Menurut Hukum Positif di Indonesia ditinjau dari Perspektif Hak Asasi Manusia," *Jurnal Kewarganegaraan*, vol. 7, no. 1, pp. 134–142, 2023.
- [26] E. R. Sari, "Perlindungan Hukum Terhadap Kesejahteraan Pelaku Olahraga Panahan Di Jawa Tengah Berdasarkan Undang- Undang Nomor 3 Tahun 2005 Tentang Sistem Keolahragaan Nasional," *Universitas Negeri Semarang*, 2020.
- [27] A. Thohawi, S. Subekan, and T. N. Fatimah, "Peran Media Sosial Terhadap Jual Beli Online Skincare Ditinjau Dari Hukum Islam di Toko Ms Glow Nganjuk," *Jurnal Dinamika Ekonomi Syariah*, vol. 8, no. 1, pp. 88–101, 2021.
- [28] P. Hudson, "Does the death row phenomenon violate a prisoner's human rights under international law?," *European Journal of International Law*, vol. 11, no. 4, pp. 833–856, 2000.
- [29] E. Rifai, "An analysis of the death penalty in Indonesia criminal law," *Sriwijaya Law Review*, vol. 1, no. 2, pp. 190–199, 2017.

- [30] L. L. Jubilit, "Death penalty and mental illness: The challenge of reconciling human rights, criminal law, and psychiatric standards," *Seattle J. Soc. Just.*, vol. 6, p. 353, 2007.
- [31] L. Sina, "Implementation of the Death Penalty in the Perspective of Human Rights in Indonesia," *Hasanuddin Law Review*, vol. 2, no. 3, pp. 385–397, 2016.
- [32] S. Rahela, "Law of Death Penalty: A Study from Human Rights Perspective," 2016.
- [33] D. C. Baldus, G. Woodworth, and C. A. Pulaski, *Equal justice and the death penalty: A legal and empirical analysis*. Upne, 1990.

BIOGRAPHIES OF AUTHORS

	<p>Kadek Arya Putra Gunawan Bachelor of Law at Legal Studies Program, Ganesha University of Education. Studied Bachelor for 3.5 years by taking a concentration in Criminal Law. Then continued his Master's Studies at Udayana University. Email : kadekaryaputra@gmail.com</p>
	<p>I Nyoman Bagiastra Bachelor of Law at Udayana University, then continued his Master's Studies at Brawijaya University. After completing his master's education, he continued his Doctoral Education in Law at Udayana University. Email nyoman_bagiastra@unud.ac.id</p>