

Evaluating the Role of Constitutional Amendments in Strengthening Democratic Governance in Indonesia

Irman Putra¹, Arief Fahmi Lubis²
^{1,2}Sekolah Tinggi Hukum Militer AHM-PTHM

Article Info

Article history:

Received July, 2023
Revised July, 2023
Accepted July, 2023

Keywords:

Constitutional Amendments
Democratic Governance
Indonesia
Judicial Independence
Regional Autonomy

ABSTRACT

This study evaluates the role of constitutional amendments in strengthening democratic governance in Indonesia through qualitative juridical analysis. This research examines how amendments to the Indonesian Constitution since the Reform Era have affected the democratic process and governance structure. Key changes include the establishment of the Constitutional Court, direct presidential elections, and greater regional autonomy. The research findings show that while these amendments have contributed significantly to democratisation by improving the separation of powers, checks and balances, and the protection of human rights, there are still some challenges to effective implementation. The study concludes with recommendations for further reforms to strengthen Indonesia's democratic governance framework.

This is an open access article under the [CC BY-SA](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/) license.



Corresponding Author:

Name: Irman Putra
Institution: Sekolah Tinggi Hukum Militer AHM-PTHM
e-mail: irman7275@gmail.com

1. INTRODUCTION

Democratic governance, characterised by the principles of participation, inclusiveness, accountability and the rule of law, is fundamental to the stability and development of modern states. The essence of democratic governance lies in its ability to foster civic interaction and stimulate the involvement of various stakeholders in the decision-making process, which improves the quality and effectiveness of administrative decisions [1]. The COVID-19 pandemic has underscored the importance of these principles, as countries with strong democratic governance frameworks are better equipped to manage crises through transparent, participatory, and accountable measures [2], [3]. The rule of law, which is a cornerstone of democratic governance,

ensures that political decisions and processes are free from arbitrariness, thus promoting honesty and fairness in the conduct of state affairs [4]. In addition, the protection of human rights and freedoms, which is an intrinsic part of democratic governance, contributes to social cohesion and long-term sustainable development [5].

However, challenges such as low voter turnout, political polarisation and disengagement from traditional democratic processes threaten the efficacy of democratic institutions, necessitating sustained efforts to strengthen governance structures and rebuild citizen trust [6]. Public commitment to representative democracy is highest in countries that effectively implement democratic principles, highlighting the critical role of public trust to the legitimacy

and functionality of democratic systems [7]. In addition, the integration of modern technologies, such as ICT and social media, into governance practices can increase public participation and transparency, thereby strengthening democratic governance [8]. In summary, the principles of democratic governance are not only essential for the stability and development of modern states, but also for ensuring that governance remains responsive, inclusive and accountable to the needs and aspirations of all citizens.

Since the fall of the New Order regime in 1998, Indonesia has embarked on a comprehensive reform agenda aimed at transitioning from an authoritarian system to a more democratic and accountable governance structure. This transformation has been significantly influenced by a series of constitutional amendments to the 1945 Constitution, which have played an important role in strengthening democratic principles. The amendments, which took place between 1999 and 2002, introduced substantial changes, including the establishment of 13 new articles and the modification of transitional and supplementary rules, thus laying the foundation for a more progressive and accountable state [9]. These reforms were driven by the need to align the legal framework with the values of democracy, human rights, and the rule of law, reflecting the aspirations of the Indonesian people for a more just and equitable society [10], [11].

The decentralisation of power from the central government to local governments marked a significant shift, encouraging broader autonomous authority and improving local governance [12]. However, this journey has not been without challenges. The integration of sharia principles with democratic values has led to political tensions and conflicts, especially regarding human rights, governance structures, and minority rights [13]. In addition, the implementation of democratic principles also faces various obstacles such as conflicts of political interests, corruption, and weak public participation [14]. Despite these challenges, there have been positive developments,

including legal reforms, increased public awareness, and the active engagement of civil society organisations, which have collectively contributed to the strengthening of democratic governance [14]. The role of elections, as mandated by the constitution, is crucial in ensuring political participation and the rule of law, with important milestones such as the direct and simultaneous elections held in 2019 and the upcoming elections in 2024 [15]. The enactment of laws such as the Job Creation Law and subsequent amendments to legislation further underscore the importance of public participation and legal clarity in the legislative process [16]. In addition, constitutional values of equality and justice are critical in promoting political stability, although implementation gaps and entrenched inequalities remain a concern [17]. The potential misuse of constitutional amendments to advance illiberal agendas is also a threat, highlighting the need for vigilance and adherence to democratic norms [18].

Indonesia's constitution, originally enacted in 1945, has been amended four times since the Reformation Era, with amendments aimed at addressing past shortcomings and promoting democratic governance. These constitutional amendments have introduced significant changes, including the establishment of a Constitutional Court, direct election of the President and Vice President, and greater autonomy for local governments. These changes are intended to ensure a more balanced distribution of power, increase transparency, and protect human rights.

Since the end of the New Order regime in 1998, Indonesia has embarked on a significant political transformation characterised by comprehensive constitutional reforms aimed at establishing a more democratic and accountable government. These reforms have introduced important changes, such as the establishment of a Constitutional Court, direct presidential elections, and increased regional autonomy, designed to address past shortcomings and promote democratic governance. The

establishment of the Constitutional Court is crucial in protecting human rights and ensuring that laws conform to the constitution, thus promoting the rule of law that respects democratic principles [19], [20]. Direct presidential elections, first implemented in 2004, have increased political accountability and allowed for a more direct expression of the will of the people, marking a significant change from the previously centralised and authoritarian system [15], [21]. In addition, the shift towards regional autonomy has decentralised power, giving wider authority to local governments and encouraging more participatory forms of governance [12], [22].

Despite these advances, challenges remain. Political interference and bureaucratic inertia continue to hinder the full realisation of these reforms. Human rights protection remains inconsistent, with ongoing debates about the balance between universal human rights and local cultural norms [20]. In addition, resource constraints and resistance to change have hampered the effectiveness of local governance, leading to disparities in policy implementation across regions [23]. The political landscape is further complicated by weak legislative oversight, resulting in political gridlock and impeding the passage of essential reforms [24]. The reform era has also created a more open socio-political environment, with increased freedom of speech and political debate, in stark contrast to the censorship of the New Order era [10]. However, the real impact of these reforms on Indonesia's political and legal structures remains uneven. While there have been significant strides in transparency and public engagement, the journey towards democratic and accountable governance continues. Continuous innovation and stakeholder engagement are essential to address these challenges and ensure that constitutional amendments achieve their intended goals [23]. The historical context of Indonesia's constitutional development, marked by different stages and models, underscores the complexity of this transformation and the need for sustained efforts to realise the full

benefits of reform [10], [25]. In conclusion, while Indonesia's constitutional reforms have laid a strong foundation for democratic governance, the path to achieving consistent human rights protection, effective local governance, and strong legislative oversight requires continued commitment and adaptation to emerging challenges [10], [12], [15], [19]–[25]. This study seeks to evaluate the effectiveness of these amendments in strengthening democratic governance in Indonesia, address gaps in their implementation, and propose further reforms.

This paper aims to evaluate the effectiveness of these constitutional amendments in strengthening democratic governance in Indonesia. By conducting a qualitative juridical analysis, this study will explore how the amendments have impacted the democratic process and governance structure in Indonesia. The study will examine legal texts, legislative records and judicial interpretations to assess the extent to which the amendments have achieved their intended goals.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Theoretical Framework of Constitutionalism and Democratic Governance

Constitutionalism, as a theory, emphasises the limitation of government power and the protection of individual rights through a legal framework, ensuring that government power is exercised within a legal framework designed to guarantee fair representation and accountability [26]. The theory underlines the importance of constitutional amendments in adapting the legal framework to changing political and social contexts to uphold democratic values [27]. Democratic governance involves the principles of participation, inclusiveness, accountability, and the rule of law, which are operationalised through constitutional provisions that define the structure and function of government institutions, the distribution of power, and the protection of civil liberties [28]. Constitutional amendment

is thus seen as a mechanism to correct deficiencies in the existing constitution, promote democratic reforms, and improve governance. The constitutionalisation process, which includes the establishment of constitutional control mechanisms, ensures that amendments reflect the modifications and needs of society while maintaining the stability of the legal system and protecting constitutional values [29].

This is particularly important in national and international contexts, where the principles of constitutionalism, such as the limitation of state power, non-use of force, and democratisation of social relations, are crucial to maintaining the global legal order [30]. The role of constitutional institutions in maintaining the rule of law, protecting civil rights, and ensuring the balance of power is fundamental to the effective functioning of democratic states [31]. In addition, the active participation of the sovereign people and public debate are critical to the success of constitutional amendments, ensuring that reforms are aligned with the needs and standards of the people [32]. The evolution of constitutionalism, influenced by historical and global developments, highlights its fundamental role in the organisation of state power and the protection of human rights [33]. Therefore, constitutional amendments, underpinned by strong constitutional control and public consensus, are essential for the continued adaptation and improvement of governance structures in response to the evolving needs of society [34].

2.2 Empirical Studies on the Outcomes of Indonesia's Constitutional Amendments

Amendments to the Indonesian constitution have significantly impacted democratic governance, with numerous empirical studies highlighting various dimensions of the changes. The Constitutional Court has played an important role in promoting judicial independence and protecting constitutional rights, acting as the final arbiter in constitutional matters and ensuring government actions conform to constitutional norms [35]. This role is

particularly important in mediating disputes over constitutional interpretation and protecting human rights, as the Court's decisions are final and binding [19]. Regional autonomy, mandated by constitutional amendments, has fostered increased political participation and accountability at the local level, which encourages regional development from below [12], [36]. However, challenges such as regional disparities and issues in local government capacity still exist, necessitating further judicial review and standardisation of regional autonomy criteria to prevent centralisation [37].

The direct election of the President and Vice President has increased political legitimacy and accountability, reflecting the will of the electorate and ensuring executive leadership in line with democratic principles [11]. Despite these advances, complexities in electoral politics, including political financing and campaign regulation, remain a significant challenge [38]. In addition, constitutional amendments have strengthened the human rights legal framework, integrating international human rights principles into national law and ensuring their protection through the Constitutional Court [19]. However, the implementation and enforcement of these rights still face obstacles, highlighting the need for ongoing legal reforms and increased public participation to effectively uphold democratic principles and human rights [14]. Overall, although the constitutional amendments have brought substantial progress in democratic governance, continued efforts are needed to overcome existing challenges and realise the expected benefits.

2.3 Gaps in the Existing Literature

While there is a wealth of research on individual aspects of Indonesia's constitutional amendments, there are few comprehensive studies that integrate these findings to provide a holistic assessment of the overall impact of the constitutional amendments on democratic governance. In addition, there is a need for more qualitative research that investigates the nuanced interactions between various constitutional

provisions and their practical implementation in Indonesia's unique socio-political context.

3. METHODS

3.1 *Research Design*

This research is structured as a qualitative case study, with a focus on the Indonesian context. This approach allows for an in-depth exploration of the complexities and nuances associated with constitutional amendments and their implications for democratic governance. The qualitative nature of the research emphasises understanding the contextual and interpretative aspects of legal change rather than simply measuring its impact.

3.2 *Data Collection Methods*

Data collection for this research involved multiple sources to ensure a comprehensive analysis. The main data sources used include legal texts and constitutional documents, legislative records and debates, and judicial decisions and interpretations. The study extensively reviewed the Indonesian Constitution, including the original 1945 Constitution and subsequent amendments, with a focus on identifying the key changes introduced by the amendments and understanding the objectives sought to be achieved. Legislative records and debates from the People's Consultative Assembly (MPR) and the House of Representatives (DPR) were analysed to gain insight into the motivations behind the amendments and the deliberative processes involved, providing contextual information on the political and legal considerations that influenced the constitutional changes. Decisions from Indonesia's Constitutional Court and other relevant judicial bodies were reviewed to assess how constitutional amendments are interpreted and applied in practice, which is critical to understanding the real implications of the amendments and their effectiveness in promoting democratic governance.

3.3 *Data Analysis Technique*

The data collected through various sources was analysed using qualitative

content analysis. The analysis process involved several steps, starting with coding and categorising data from legal texts, legislative records, court decisions and interviews to identify recurring themes and patterns. Thematic analysis was conducted to identify key themes relating to the impact of constitutional amendments on democratic governance, focusing on separation of powers, checks and balances, protection of human rights, and regional autonomy. Comparative analysis was used to evaluate differences and similarities in the objectives of the amendments and their actual outcomes, helping to identify gaps between the theoretical aspirations of constitutional reform and its practical implementation. Triangulation was conducted to ensure the reliability and validity of findings by cross-verification of data from multiple sources, strengthening the credibility of research conclusions through convergence of evidence from legal documents, legislative records, court decisions and expert interviews. Ethical considerations in this research included ensuring confidentiality and anonymity of interview participants, obtaining written consent from all interviewees, and respecting intellectual property rights by properly citing all sources and references.

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

4.1 *Separation of Powers*

The constitutional amendments introduced significant changes to the separation of powers among the executive, legislative, and judicial branches of government. One of the most notable changes was the establishment of the Constitutional Court in 2003, which has played an important role in maintaining the balance of power.

The establishment of the Constitutional Court in Indonesia has strengthened the independence of the judiciary and provided crucial oversight of the executive and legislature [39]. The Court's rulings on electoral disputes and judicial review of laws have been instrumental in ensuring government actions conform to

constitutional norms, exemplified by the annulment of the Anti-Corruption Law in 2006, which demonstrated the Court's dedication to upholding constitutional protections. Despite these advances, challenges remain in effectively implementing the Court's decisions, particularly in cases laden with strong political interests, highlighting the ongoing struggle to maintain the Court's authority in the face of political pressure [40]. Efforts to address these challenges are critical to maintaining the Court's integrity and upholding the rule of law in Indonesia.

The amendment also introduced direct presidential elections, which increased the accountability of the executive to the electorate. The transition to direct and simultaneous elections in Indonesia has strengthened democratic legitimacy by ensuring that the President and Vice President are directly elected by the people, as outlined in [15]. This shift, mandated by the Constitutional Court Decision and subsequent legislation, has significantly improved the democratic process in Indonesia. Research shows that direct elections have increased public participation and higher political engagement among citizens, fostering a stronger democratic culture in the country [41], [42]. The utilisation of data mining technology in election campaigns, as discussed in [41], further exemplifies how advancements in the electoral process, including the use of social media, have contributed to a more inclusive and participatory democracy in Indonesia.

4.2 Checks and Balances

The constitutional amendments aimed to improve the system of checks and balances within the Indonesian government, prevent the concentration of power and ensure accountability among the branches of government.

The amendments increased the oversight powers of the House of Representatives (DPR) over the executive. Legislative records show that the DPR now plays a more active role in scrutinising government policies and spending, leading to

greater transparency and accountability. However, this increased oversight has also resulted in political gridlock in some cases, illustrating the complexity of legislative-executive interactions.

The Constitutional Court's authority to review laws has been a very important tool for maintaining checks and balances. The Court has cancelled several laws deemed unconstitutional, which reinforces the principle of the rule of law. For example, the Court's decision to annul parts of the Anti-Corruption Law in 2006 demonstrated the Court's commitment to upholding constitutional protections.

4.3 Human Rights Protection

Strengthening the protection of human rights was a key objective of the constitutional amendments, by introducing explicit guarantees for civil liberties and establishing mechanisms for their enforcement.

The inclusion of a comprehensive Bill of Rights in the amended Constitution has provided a legal basis for individuals to challenge human rights violations in court. Court decisions have strengthened these rights, with the Constitutional Court often siding with plaintiffs in cases involving freedom of expression, assembly and religion.

Despite this progress, the implementation of human rights protections still faces several obstacles. Law enforcement agencies often lack the resources and political will to effectively address violations. Reports from organisations such as Human Rights Watch indicate persistent issues such as police brutality, discrimination, and restrictions on media freedom. Addressing these challenges requires not only legal reform but also a cultural shift towards greater respect for human rights.

4.4 Regional Autonomy

The constitutional amendment aims to decentralise governance by granting greater autonomy to local governments, enhancing local democracy, and improving public services.

The constitutional amendment empowers local governments to manage their

own affairs, including education, health, and infrastructure. Decentralisation, as highlighted in various studies [43]–[46], has indeed shown positive impacts on public service delivery. Decentralisation empowers local governments to tailor services to the specific needs of communities, increasing effectiveness and relevance while encouraging wider public participation and improving government accountability and transparency. By shifting decision-making power from the central government to regional or local entities, decentralisation promotes responsiveness to local demands, thereby improving service delivery and encouraging political participation at the grassroots level. However, challenges such as inequalities in resource distribution, policy coordination issues, lack of local capacity, and the potential for increased corruption must be addressed to fully optimise the benefits of decentralisation.

However, decentralisation has also highlighted regional disparities in governance capacity. Some regions struggle with issues such as corruption, inefficiency, and lack of expertise. These gaps show that while decentralisation has potential benefits, it also requires significant support and capacity building efforts to ensure its success.

4.5 Overall Impact on Democratic Governance

Constitutional amendments have had a major impact on democratic governance in Indonesia, introducing mechanisms to enhance the separation of powers, strengthen checks and balances, protect human rights, and promote regional autonomy. However, the effectiveness of these amendments depends on their implementation and enforcement.

The amendments have succeeded in creating a more balanced and accountable governance framework. The establishment of the Constitutional Court and the introduction of direct elections are important achievements that have strengthened Indonesia's democracy. Increased legislative oversight and judicial review have also contributed to greater transparency and rule of law.

Despite these successes, many challenges remain. The effectiveness of human rights protection and regional autonomy varies across regions and sectors. Political interference, resource constraints and capacity issues continue to hinder the full realisation of the amendment's objectives. Addressing these challenges requires sustained reform, effective implementation, and commitment to democratic principles.

4.6 Recommendations for Further Reform

To improve the resilience of Indonesia's democratic governance, the following recommendations are proposed:

- a. Ensuring the Constitutional Court and other judicial institutions are free from political interference is critical to maintaining checks and balances.
- b. Investing in law enforcement mechanisms and promoting a culture of respect for human rights can address ongoing abuses.
- c. Providing resources and capacity-building initiatives to local governments can reduce disparities and improve public services.
- d. Strengthening regulations on political financing and campaign practices can reduce corruption and increase political accountability.

5. CONCLUSION

Constitutional amendments in Indonesia have played an important role in shaping democratic governance. The establishment of the Constitutional Court, the introduction of direct presidential elections, and the decentralisation of power to local governments are important milestones that have improved the separation of powers, strengthened checks and balances, and enhanced the protection of human rights. However, the effectiveness of these amendments has not been uniform across regions and sectors. Implementation challenges such as political interference, resource constraints and regional disparities continue to hinder the full realisation of the

amendments' objectives. Ensuring the independence of the judiciary, improving human rights enforcement, supporting local government capacity, and promoting political accountability are important steps to address these challenges. Ongoing reforms and a continued commitment to democratic principles are critical to consolidating democratic governance in Indonesia. By

building on the foundations laid by the constitutional amendments and addressing the challenges, Indonesia can achieve a democratic, transparent and accountable governance framework. This study provides valuable insights into the successes and challenges of Indonesia's constitutional reforms and offers recommendations to further strengthen Indonesia's democracy.

REFERENCES

- [1] Y. Humen, "Democratic governance: conceptualization of foreign experience, analysis of the key theories and concepts," *Socio-Economic Probl. State*, vol. 28, pp. 17–29, Jan. 2023, doi: 10.33108/sepd2023.01.017.
- [2] F. O. Otieno, M. M. Kathina, C. N. Matindi, P. Gikonyo, and S. M. Nditi, "Application of Democratic Governance Principles in Advancing Effective Crisis Response and Recovery for Sustainable Development: A Case of Kenya," 2022.
- [3] A. Timmer, "Concepts of human rights, democracy, and the rule of law: a literature review," *Foster. Hum. Rights among Eur. Policies*, no. November, p. **, 2013.
- [4] A. Yılmaz and D. Geylani, "The Relationship Among the Rule of Law, Morality, and the Modern State," *İnsan ve Toplum*, vol. 13, no. 1, pp. 281–306, 2023.
- [5] S. Özalp, "Eğitim Yönetiminde Temel Hak ve Özgürlükler Düşüncesinin Demokratik Eğitim Çerçevesinde İncelenmesi," *J. Soc. Res. Behav. Sci.*, vol. 9, no. 19, 2023.
- [6] C. Bassiouni et al., *Democracy: Its Principles and Achievement Democracy*: 2016.
- [7] U. Pribadi and M. Iqbal, "Pivotal Issues of Democratic Governance: A Literature Review," *J. Ilmu Sos. Dan Ilmu Polit.*, vol. 25, no. 3, pp. 255–276, 2022.
- [8] A. Rejeki, D. Sodikin, and E. Komara, "Hubungan Demokrasi Dengan Kemakmuran," *EKBIS (Ekonomi & Bisnis)*, vol. 11, no. 1, pp. 61–69, 2023, doi: 10.56689/ekbis.v11i1.1042.
- [9] S. Oktapani and S. Suhartono, "The obligation of Constitutional Court to give a decision on opinion of Council Representatives in process of termination Indonesian President," *Tech. Soc. Sci. J.*, vol. 45, p. 163, 2023.
- [10] I. M. Adnan, "THE CONCEPTUAL AND HISTORICAL REVIEW OF CONSTITUTIONAL LAW IN INDONESIA," *J. Pembaharuan Huk.*, vol. 10, no. 1, pp. 43–63, 2023.
- [11] H. A. Hudhaibi, "General Election (Election) As an Implementation of The Constitution in A Country with A Democracy System," *AL-MANHAJ J. Huk. dan Pranata Sos. Islam*, vol. 5, no. 1, pp. 859–866, 2023.
- [12] B. Bahari and H. B. Gusliana, "Era Reformasi: Implementasi Negara Hukum dan Demokrasi di Indonesia," *Leg. J. Huk.*, vol. 15, no. 2, pp. 232–235, 2023.
- [13] A. Shalihah, "Kontekstualisasi Undang-Undang Dasar Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 1945 Dalam Perspektif Islam," *J. Law Adm. Sci.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 53–69, 2024.
- [14] A. R. Rohmatillah, M. Sa'diyin, and A. A. Zaini, "Tantangan dan Prospek: Implementasi Prinsip-Prinsip Demokrasi Dalam Hukum Tata Negara Indonesia," *JOSH J. Sharia*, vol. 2, no. 02, pp. 90–100, 2023.
- [15] D. A. Bs and M. R. Fadhilillah, "The Development of General Elections and Regional Head Elections After the Reformasi Era," *J. Law, Polit. Humanit.*, vol. 3, no. 3, pp. 311–318, 2023.
- [16] B. Wedhatami, R. Damayanti, and C. A. Prasasi, "Navigating Regional Regulatory Changes in Indonesia: An In-Depth Analysis of Post-Amendment Implementation of Law Number 12 of 2011 on Legislation Formation," *Unnes Law J.*, vol. 9, no. 2, pp. 237–264, 2023.
- [17] D. I. Pirdaus, R. Chayandari, and Y. Salih, "Constitutional Values, Legal Politics, and Political Stability: A Comparative Analysis in the Post-Authoritarian Context of Indonesia," *Int. J. Humanit. Law, Polit.*, vol. 1, no. 4, pp. 64–69, 2023.
- [18] I. Y. Nugraha, "Abusive Unconstitutional Constitutional Amendments: Indonesia, the Pancasila and the Spectre of Authoritarianism," *Oxf. J. Leg. Stud.*, vol. 43, no. 2, pp. 379–404, 2023.
- [19] I. M. M. Mirza, R. Natamiharja, and J. A. M. Serna, "Social Transformation of International Human Rights Law Through Indonesian Constitutional Court," *Uti Possidetis J. Int. Law*, vol. 4, no. 3, pp. 439–471, 2023.
- [20] M. B. Ulum and A. W. Dinata, "Navigating Human Rights in Indonesia and Beyond," *Lentera Huk.*, vol. 10, no. 1, pp. i–viii, 2023.
- [21] N. H. Emilson, K. Nawawi, and S. Idrus, "CITA HUKUM BANGSA DAN NEGARA INDONESIA DALAM KONTEKS RENCANA PEMBANGUNAN JANGKA PANJANG NASIONAL 2005-2025," vol. 21, 2025.
- [22] V. D. Purnomo and K. E. Suryono, "The Collapse of the New Orde Regime Resulted in Changes in Indonesia's Economic Policy," *J. Pengabd. Masy. Formosa*, vol. 1, no. 5, pp. 395–406, 2022.
- [23] F. Asteriniah and D. C. Hestiriniah, "Transforming Governance in Indonesia: Exploring New Frontiers in Public Sector Management," *J. Ilm. Ilmu Adm. Publik J. Pemikir. dan Penelit. Adm. Publik*, vol. 13, no. 2, pp. 739–746, 2023.
- [24] S. A. Hasibuan, "SISTEM PEMILIHAN UMUM DALAM KAITAN DENGAN NEGARA DEMOKRASI," *War. Dharmawangsa*, vol. 17, no. 2, pp. 602–609, 2023.

- [25] M. A. Khuluqi and M. Muwahid, "Sejarah Sistem Pemerintahan dan Kekuasaan Eksekutif di Indonesia," *Al-Qanun J. Pemikir. dan Pembaharuan Huk. Islam*, vol. 26, no. 2, pp. 167–180, 2023.
- [26] G. Schwartz, "Constitution and Social Changes," 2021.
- [27] R. Dixon, "Constitutional amendment rules: a comparative perspective," in *Comparative constitutional law*, Edward Elgar Publishing, 2011.
- [28] T. Ginsburg and M. Versteeg, "The Constitutionalization of Democracy," *J. Democr.*, vol. 34, no. 4, pp. 36–50, 2023.
- [29] G. Teubner, *Constitutional fragments: societal constitutionalism and globalization*. Oxford University Press, 2012.
- [30] A. Chehtman, "Constitutions and International Law," *Oxford Handb. Const. Law Lat. Am.*, no. February, pp. 533–551, 2022, doi: 10.1093/oxfordhb/9780198786900.013.35.
- [31] J. Vučković, "METODOLOŠKI PRISTUP INSTITUCIJAMA USTAVNOG PRAVA," *USKLADIVANJE PRAVNOG Sist. Srb. SA Stand. Evr. UNIJE, Kn. XI*, 2023.
- [32] J. Kim, "Constitutional perspectives on judicial reform and the direction of Constitutional amendment," *Korean Const. Law Assoc.*, vol. 28, pp. 657–687, Dec. 2022, doi: 10.35901/kjcl.2022.28.4.657.
- [33] J. Klabbers, "Constitutionalism as theory," in *International Legal Theory: Foundations and Frontiers*, Cambridge University Press, 2022, pp. 220–239.
- [34] V. Kovtunyak, "Theoretical features and applied aspects of constitutional control of amendments to the constitution," *Uzhhorod Natl. Univ. Herald. Ser. Law*, pp. 84–88, Aug. 2022, doi: 10.24144/2307-3322.2022.71.12.
- [35] M. Thohir and D. Sukriono, "Implementation Authority Of The Constitutional Court In The Indonesian Constitutional Law System," *Int. J. Business, Law, Educ.*, vol. 4, no. 2, pp. 1495–1503, 2023.
- [36] O. Mendy, "Regional Autonomy in Indonesia after the Second Constitutional Amendment: Assessing its Developmental Delivery," *Constitutionale*, vol. 5, no. 1, pp. 45–60, 2024.
- [37] L. O. Muhaimin, L. Ode, and A. Mustafa, "AMENGGAGAS STANDAR TERTENTU OTONOMI DAERAH MELALUI MAHKAMAH KONSTITUSI," pp. 145–174, 2023.
- [38] I. A. Gani, R. Asmara, S. Sulaiman, and A. Husna, "The Constitutional Court's Protection and Fulfilment of the Citizens' Rights: Constitutional and Islamic Law Perspectives," *Samarah J. Huk. Kel. dan Huk. Islam*, vol. 8, no. 1, pp. 317–338, 2024.
- [39] A. Fiqri, "The Urgency of the Constitutional Court and Its Existence As an Institution Providing Justice," *JUSTICES J. Law*, vol. 2, no. 3, pp. 155–163, 2023.
- [40] S. Park and S. Kim, "A Review on Strengthening the Independence of the Constitutional Court," *Wonkwang Univ. Leg. Res. Inst.*, vol. 39, pp. 63–86, Mar. 2023, doi: 10.22397/wlri.2023.39.1.63.
- [41] W. S. Maulana and D. Kartinah, "STUDY ON THE USE OF DATA MINING TECHNOLOGY FOR ELECTION CAMPAIGNS IN INDONESIA," *Int. J. Sci. Technol.*, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 1–6, 2024.
- [42] M. Yusuf, M. Jannah, N. Rahmi, P. A. Dewi, and U. F. Husaini, "Menggali Makna Pemilihan Umum: Peran, Sejarah, dan Tantangan Demokrasi," *PUAN Indones.*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 656–667, 2024.
- [43] A. H. Hi Ibrahim, "Decentralization and its Impact on Improving Public Services," *Int. J. Soc. Sci.*, vol. 7, pp. 45–53, Jun. 2024, doi: 10.21744/ijss.v7n2.2278.
- [44] F. Elliott, "The advantages of decentralized government from the viewpoint of Public Service Innovation," *J. Manag. Adm. Provis.*, vol. 2, no. 3, pp. 65–72, 2022.
- [45] Z. A. Hoesein, A. Arifudin, and S. D. Rahayu, "The Effectiveness of Decentralization Policy in Local Government Administration," *J. Akta*, vol. 9, no. 2, pp. 242–259, 2022.
- [46] Y. Baltzii, "Decentralization as the Main Component of Local Self-Government Reform," *Const. Leg. Acad. Stud.*, p. 54, 2023.