

Legal Challenges in Regulating and Supervising Street Vendors in Banten Province

Hudjolly¹, Yana Priyana²

¹Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University

²Juanda University

Article Info

Article history:

Received October 2023

Revised October 2023

Accepted October 2023

Keywords:

Street vending

Banten Province

Legal difficulties

Regulatory environment

Vulnerable communities

Regulatory framework

ABSTRACT

In Banten Province, Indonesia, street vending is a prominent and vibrant economic activity that boosts local economies and the region's cultural diversity. Nonetheless, there are particular legal difficulties with regard to street vending oversight and control. This study examines the perspectives and experiences of street vendors, looks into the legal ramifications of street vending in Banten Province, and considers the wider implications for community well-being and government. The results show a complicated regulatory environment with conflicting laws, uneven enforcement, and unclear provisions. Street sellers routinely run afoul of the law, struggle to get licenses, and have run-ins with the law, all of which contribute to their financial instability. Inadequate enforcement, corruption, and rent-seeking conduct are examples of regulatory issues that disproportionately affect vulnerable communities. Comparative analyses provide information from globally effective techniques. Simplifying licensing processes, boosting public awareness campaigns, strengthening enforcement strategies, and encouraging participatory regulation are among the recommendations. It is also suggested to create zones specifically for vending. The objective of these proposals is to create a balanced environment that is advantageous to both street sellers and the larger community by creating a more equitable and effective regulatory framework for street vending in Banten Province.

This is an open access article under the [CC BY-SA](#) license.



Corresponding Author:

Name: Hudjolly

Institution: Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University

e-mail: djollyhood@yahoo.co.id

1. INTRODUCTION

Banten Province, located on the western tip of the island of Java, is characterized by a vibrant urban environment and diverse economic activities. The region's cities and towns are home to many street vendors, who offer a diverse range of products, from street food and clothing to electronics and handicrafts. Street vendors have a significant socio-economic impact on

the communities they serve. On the one hand, they provide affordable goods and services to low-income residents [1]–[3]. On the other hand, they are often unregistered and illegal, which can lead to problems with traffic barriers and public order [4]–[7]. The COVID-19 pandemic has had a significant impact on street vendors, with many losing their regular source of income [8]–[11].

In some cases, street vendors have had to change their profession [1]. However, street vendors can also be a source of economic opportunity, especially for those with limited capital [12]. In some countries, street vending supports the income of the poor [9]. The presence of street vendors can also attract tourists and contribute to the local economy [13]. Overall, the socio-economic impact of street vendors is complex and depends on various factors such as government policies, economic conditions, and cultural norms. However, despite their significance, the legal landscape governing street vendors in Banten Province is characterized by complexities and challenges.

Street vending regulation encompasses various aspects such as licensing, zoning, health and safety standards, and taxation. These regulations are designed to balance the needs of vendors, consumers, and the community at large. However, the implementation of these regulations often presents difficulties and raises concerns about their fairness, transparency, and effectiveness. The search results provide various studies and research on street vending regulation in different countries, including India, China, South Africa, and Morocco. These studies highlight the challenges and issues faced by street vendors and regulators, such as poor hygiene practices, lack of education and training, harassment, eviction, and confiscation of merchandise. They also suggest possible solutions and recommendations, such as creating food centers, providing formal food safety training, improving regulatory discretion, and developing national street vendor legislation. Overall, street vending regulation is a complex issue that requires a bala [14]–[17].

Street vending is a ubiquitous and dynamic economic activity that serves as a lifeline for many urban and peri-urban communities in Banten Province, Indonesia. Street vendors, often referred to as hawkers, sellers, or peddlers, play a significant role in the local economy by offering a diverse range of goods and services to residents and visitors. The vibrancy and vitality of street vending

contribute to the cultural richness of the region and provide opportunities for entrepreneurship and livelihoods.

While street vending has long been a part of the socio-economic landscape of Banten Province, it is not without its challenges, particularly concerning the legal framework and regulatory practices that govern this activity. This research is motivated by the recognition that the legal challenges faced by street vendors in Banten Province can have profound implications for both the vendors and the communities they serve. The study aims to shed light on the existing legal framework and regulatory practices to identify areas where improvements can be made. It is essential to find a balance between creating an enabling environment for street vendors to thrive and ensuring that public interests, such as health, safety, and urban aesthetics, are adequately protected.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Definition and Classification of Street Vendors

Street vending is a vital component of the informal economy, providing a source of income and livelihood for a substantial segment of the population. However, the informal nature of street vending makes it challenging to categorize and regulate. Street vendors operate within a spectrum of formality, from entirely unregistered and unregulated activities to semi-formal or licensed operations. Policymakers and local authorities face difficulties in categorizing and regulating street vending due to its diverse nature and informality. Street vendors face various challenges, including harassment by civic authorities, lack of working places, eviction from selling places, lack of market, non-profitability of the business, lack of credit, lack of freedom and social security during operation of their business, and cleanness of their working environment. Street vending is a global phenomenon, and different cities have different policies and approaches towards it. The rise of street

vendors who crowded the heart of the city has a positive impact on the economy, both small and medium scale. However, the rampant of street vendors who sell on the roadside raises a complicated problem, and the government seeks to find the right solution in the efforts to protect, control and guide street vendors, one of them is by relocating street vendors to several locations and buildings that have been provided. To ensure sustainable livelihoods for those working in the informal economy, policymakers need to design inclusive and sustainable policies that take into account the considerable diversity among street vendors regarding employment relation, gender, age, capital, and assets. The current policies and issuing of identification cards offer new opportunities for vendors to organize and claim their rights, but they need to be unambiguous and implemented effectively [18]–[22].

2.2 The Role of Street Vendors in Local Economies

Street vending plays a significant role in local economies, providing accessible and affordable goods and services to communities, often in areas where formal retail establishments are scarce or less accessible. Street vendors contribute to price competition, increase consumer choice, and enhance economic resilience in times of crisis. They also serve as a source of livelihood for marginalized or economically vulnerable populations, including women, migrants, and low-income individuals. Street vending carries cultural and social importance, preserving and promoting local traditions, cuisine, and craftsmanship, making them integral to the cultural identity of a region. Street vending can create vibrant public spaces, fostering community engagement and a sense of belonging [23]–[26].

3. METHODS

This study used a mixed-methods research design, combining qualitative and quantitative research approaches to gain a comprehensive understanding of the legal challenges in regulating and supervising

street vendors in Banten Province. The use of mixed methods allows for a more nuanced exploration of this complex issue, integrating the experiences and perspectives of street vendors with empirical data on the legal framework.

3.1 Qualitative Data Collection

Qualitative data was collected through in-depth interviews with a sample of street vendors and key stakeholders involved in the regulation of street vendors. These stakeholders included local government officials, law enforcement officers, and representatives from non-governmental organizations working on urban development and the informal economy. Qualitative interviews aimed to explore the lived experiences and perceptions of street vendors and the challenges they face within the current legal framework.

A semi-structured interview guide was developed to ensure consistency in data collection while allowing flexibility to follow up on emerging themes. Interviews were conducted in Bahasa Indonesia, the local language, to facilitate open and honest discussions. The qualitative data collection phase also included document analysis of relevant legal and policy documents, including licensing regulations, zoning regulations, and law enforcement guidelines.

3.2 Quantitative Data Collection

To complement the qualitative findings, a structured survey was conducted among a random sample of street vendors in Banten Province. The survey included closed-ended questions to collect quantitative data on street vendors' demographics, licensing status, awareness of regulations, and experiences with law enforcement practices. The use of surveys provides a broader perspective on street vendors' experiences and perceptions, allowing for statistical analysis and generalization.

Sampling Technique and Sample Size

The qualitative sample consisted of 25 participants. Purposive sampling was used to ensure diversity among street vendors, taking into account factors such as location, product type, license status, and experience. In

addition, 10 key stakeholders were also interviewed to gain insight into regulatory and law enforcement perspectives.

The survey was conducted among 150 randomly selected street vendors from various locations in Banten Province, covering both licensed and unlicensed vendors. The sample size was determined based on statistical power calculations to ensure reliable results. Random sampling was facilitated through a list of street vendors provided by the local government.

3.3 Data Analysis Methods

Qualitative data collected through interviews and document analysis were thematically analyzed. This analysis involved a systematic process of coding, categorizing, and interpreting data to identify themes, patterns, and emerging issues related to street vendor regulation. The qualitative analysis helped provide depth and context to the identified legal challenges.

Quantitative data from the survey was analyzed using statistical software. Descriptive statistics, including frequencies and percentages, were used to summarize demographic and survey-related data. Inferential statistics, such as chi-square tests and regression analysis, were used to test associations and relationships between variables, including licensing status, awareness of regulations, and law enforcement experience.

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

4.1 Legal Framework for Street Vendors in Banten Province

In investigating the legal framework governing street vendors in Banten Province, several important findings emerged:

Complex Regulatory Landscape, Banten Province's approach to street vendor regulation is characterized by a complex and multi-layered structure. Different levels of government, including local, provincial and national governments, play a significant role in shaping the regulatory framework. The result is a convoluted system, which often leads to overlapping or conflicting regulations

and a lack of clarity for street vendors and regulators.

Licensing and Zoning Challenges, Licensing requirements in the province were identified as complex and time-consuming. Street vendors, especially those in the informal sector, reported significant difficulties in obtaining licenses due to bureaucratic hurdles. In addition, zoning regulations do not always align with the dynamic nature of street vendors, leading to frequent clashes between street vendors and local governments over acceptable locations.

Inconsistent Enforcement Practices, Enforcement of street vendor regulations shows a lack of consistency. The severity and frequency of enforcement actions can vary widely from jurisdiction to jurisdiction, and even within the same area, actions can appear arbitrary. Street vendors report uncertainty, which contributes to insecurity in their livelihoods.

Ambiguity and Lack of Clarity in Regulations, Legal provisions related to street vendors are often found to be ambiguous and unclear. The lack of explicit definitions and guidelines results in confusion and misunderstanding, leading to disputes and conflicts between street vendors and local governments.

4.2 Perceptions and Experiences of Street Vendors

Through in-depth interviews with street vendors, this study reveals valuable insights into their experiences and perspectives:

Challenges in Licensing Procedures, Street vendors consistently expressed frustration with the complicated and time-consuming licensing process. For many, obtaining a license is a difficult bureaucratic ordeal that often results in considerable delays and costs. As a result, some unlicensed vendors choose to operate informally due to the difficulties associated with formalization.

Low Awareness and Compliance, Most street vendors were found to have limited awareness of the specific regulations governing their activities. This lack of information, coupled with a lack of guidance

from authorities, adds to the compliance challenge. Street vendors often operate under conditions of uncertainty, unsure of their rights and obligations.

Conflict with authorities, A recurring theme in street vendors' narratives is their conflicts and confrontations with local authorities. Evictions and confiscation of goods are frequent complaints, often leading to strained relationships and a perception that authorities are not sympathetic to their plight.

Economic Vulnerability, Informal street vendors, in particular, grapple with precarious working conditions. Access to basic services such as sanitation and health facilities is severely limited, adding to their difficulties. The fear of eviction continues to loom large over them, as it could result in the loss of their entire source of livelihood.

4.3 Regulatory Challenges

A thorough examination of regulatory challenges underscores the legal issues faced by street vendors:

Inadequate Law Enforcement, Inconsistent and weak enforcement of street vendor regulations creates an environment where traders underestimate the risk of non-compliance. This weakens the effectiveness of regulatory efforts and fosters a culture of impunity.

Corruption and Rent-seeking Behavior, Ambiguity and inconsistency in regulations have contributed to an enabling climate for corruption and rent-seeking behavior. Street vendors recounted several cases of bribery and extortion by local officials, further undermining trust in the regulatory system.

Uneven Impact, Regulatory challenges disproportionately impact vulnerable groups, including low-income individuals, women, and migrants who depend on street vendors for livelihoods. Lack of clear regulations and arbitrary enforcement exacerbate these inequalities, thus perpetuating social and economic disparities.

4.4 Comparative Analysis

In reviewing street vendor regulations in other regions and countries,

some best practices and lessons learned can be adapted for Banten Province:

Simplification of Licensing, Some regions have successfully implemented simplified licensing procedures, reducing bureaucratic hurdles for street vendors. This simplified process has made it easier for traders to obtain the necessary permits, thus facilitating formalization.

Defined Vending Zones, The creation of clear vending zones or markets offers a practical solution to minimize spatial conflicts. By providing designated areas for street vendors, these areas can accommodate a wide variety of vendors while maintaining order and security in the city.

Participatory Approach, Effective street vendor regulation often involves input from the street vendors themselves. Involving street vendors in the regulation-making process and creating a platform for dialogue between the government and street vendor associations can lead to more effective, equitable and context-sensitive regulations.

Recommendations

Based on the research findings, the following recommendations are proposed to address the legal challenges in regulating and supervising street vendors in Banten Province:

1. **Simplify Licensing Procedures:** Local governments should take steps to simplify licensing procedures, making them more accessible and less bureaucratic. This will reduce the time and cost required to obtain permits, thereby encouraging formalization.
2. **Raising Awareness:** Authorities should develop and implement awareness campaigns aimed at informing street vendors about the regulations governing their activities. These campaigns can take the form of workshops, information brochures, and community outreach initiatives.
3. **Improve Law Enforcement:** Consistent, fair, and transparent enforcement of regulations is essential. Authorities should provide training to officials on the principles of fair law enforcement, and

mechanisms to report corruption and rent-seeking behavior should be established.

4. **Participatory Regulation:** Actively involve street vendors in the regulatory process. Establish a platform for dialogue between authorities and street vendor associations to collaboratively design regulations tailored to the local context.
5. **Specialized Street Vendor Zones:** Develop special zones for street vendors that cater to the needs of street vendors while ensuring urban order and safety. These special areas can accommodate a wide variety of vendors, promote better urban aesthetics, and minimize spatial conflicts.

Discussion

The legal challenges facing the regulation and supervision of street vendors in Banten Province are complex and deeply interwoven with broader issues of informality, economic disparity, and governance. The findings of this study align with the global conversation on the significance of recognizing the role of street vendors in urban economies and addressing the challenges they confront. The recommendations proposed here aim to chart a course towards a more equitable and effective regulatory framework, one that balances the needs of street vendors with those of the broader community.

The study underscores the importance of reforming street vending regulation in Banten Province to create an environment in which street vendors can operate formally and securely, fostering economic inclusivity and urban vibrancy. The legal challenges highlighted in this research are not insurmountable, and with comprehensive and collaborative efforts, Banten Province can move towards more equitable and effective regulation that benefits all stakeholders.

CONCLUSION

The legal challenges associated with regulating and supervising street vendors in Banten Province have been explored in depth

throughout this study. These challenges have been revealed to be complex and multi-dimensional, touching on issues of regulation, enforcement, and vendor experiences.

The legal framework governing street vending in Banten Province is intricate and often plagued by overlapping regulations, bureaucratic hurdles, and ambiguity. Licensing processes are cumbersome, enforcement is inconsistent, and rent-seeking behavior and corruption are not uncommon. The impact of these challenges is felt most acutely by vulnerable groups, including low-income individuals, women, and migrants, who depend on street vending for their livelihoods.

The experiences and perceptions of street vendors provide critical insights into the hardships they face due to the current regulatory system. These experiences include frustration with licensing procedures, limited awareness of regulations, and conflicts with local authorities. Moreover, the economic precariousness that many vendors endure due to the ever-present fear of eviction creates further uncertainty.

The comparative analysis has shed light on successful approaches to street vending regulation in other regions and countries. Streamlined licensing, designated vending zones, and participatory regulation stand out as practices that could be adapted for Banten Province.

In response to these findings, a series of recommendations has been proposed. Streamlining licensing procedures, improving awareness campaigns, enhancing enforcement practices, fostering participatory regulation, and the creation of designated vending zones are among the recommendations designed to address the legal challenges in street vending regulation. These recommendations aim to establish a more equitable and effective regulatory framework, which would benefit both street vendors and the broader community.

This research underscores the importance of recognizing the vital role of street vendors in urban economies and the need to address the legal challenges they

encounter. The challenges, while complex, are not insurmountable, and with comprehensive and collaborative efforts, Banten Province can move towards a more inclusive and effective regulatory system that promotes economic inclusivity, urban vibrancy, and social equity. Street vending can continue to enrich the cultural fabric of the region while fostering livelihoods and opportunities for vulnerable populations.

REFERENCES

- [1] S. P. Janah and H. H. Adinugraha, "Analysis Of Behavior And Sosio-Economic Impact Of Relocation Of Street Vendors During The Covid-19 Pandemic," *Al-Masharif J. Ilmu Ekon. dan Keislam.*, vol. 9, no. 2, pp. 220–234, 2021.
- [2] - Kurniawan, A. Maulana, and Y. Iskandar, "The Effect of Technology Adaptation and Government Financial Support on Sustainable Performance of MSMEs during the COVID-19 Pandemic," *Cogent Bus. Manag.*, vol. 10, no. 1, p. 2177400, 2023, doi: <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311975.2023.2177400>.
- [3] Y. Iskandar, "Entrepreneurial Literacy, Environment, and Intentions of Indonesian Students to Become Social Entrepreneurs," *J. REKOMEN (Riset Ekon. Manajemen)*, vol. 6, no. 1, pp. 9–18, 2023.
- [4] U. B. Jaman and E. Pertiwi, "Kedaulatan Pajak Negara Indonesia Terhadap Perusahaan Multinasional Digital," *J. Akt. Ris. Akunt. dan Keuang.*, vol. 5, no. 1, pp. 32–42, 2023.
- [5] U. B. Jaman, "Perlindungan hukum terhadap usaha mikro kecil dan menengah dihubungkan dengan asas kesetaraan ekonomi dalam upaya mendorong ekonomi kerakyatan." UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, 2017.
- [6] T. P. Nugrahanti, "Risk assessment and earning management in banking of Indonesia: corporate governance mechanisms," *Glob. J. Bus. Soc. Sci. Rev.*, vol. 4, no. 1, pp. 1–9, 2016.
- [7] S. Supriandi and Y. Iskandar, "FAKTOR-FAKTOR YANG MEMPENGARUHI MINAT BERWIRAUSAHA: SEBUAH STUDI LITERATUR," in *SENMABIS: Conference Series*, 2021, pp. 96–107.
- [8] K. Sivasubramanian, J. M. KP, K. B. Raj, K. Srinivas, and K. Veerakumar, "Paradigm Shift in Economic Empowerment of Street Vendors through Digital Payment Applications for Transactions in Chennai, India".
- [9] E. Handoyo, T. Wijayanti, L. Ekaningsih, and M. A. Puspita, "Economy Impact of the COVID-19 Prevention Policy on Business Continuity and Welfare of Street Vendors.," *Int. J. Sustain. Dev. Plan.*, vol. 17, no. 6, 2022.
- [10] D. O. Suparwata and R. Pomolango, "Arahan pengembangan agribisnis buah naga di pekarangan terintegrasi desa wisata Banuroja," *Agromix*, vol. 10, no. 2, pp. 85–99, 2019.
- [11] S. Supriandi and Y. Iskandar, "Strategic Business Development of Polosan Mas Ibing with the Business Model Canvas Approach," in *International Conference on Economics, Management and Accounting (ICEMAC 2021)*, Atlantis Press, 2022, pp. 164–179.
- [12] L. S. Y. Putri and I. U. Choiriyah, "Analysis of the socio-economic impact of the presence of street vendors," *Indones. J. Public Policy Rev.*, vol. 14, pp. 10–21070, 2021.
- [13] U. Dinakaran and S. Dwarkanath, "Culinary Influence on Bengaluru as a Tourism Destination".
- [14] A. Hanser, "Good food in the city: How cultural ideas about food shape street vending regulation," *Int. J. Urban Reg. Res.*, vol. 45, no. 3, pp. 519–534, 2021.
- [15] C. Acho-Chi, "The mobile street food service practice in the urban economy of Kumba, Cameroon," *Singap. J. Trop. Geogr.*, vol. 23, no. 2, pp. 131–148, 2002.
- [16] M. Parikh, "Management of Urban Street Vending in Ahmedabad: Issues and Challenges," *Asian J. Manag.*, vol. 6, no. 4, pp. 283–290, 2015.
- [17] J. S. Bell and A. Loukaitou-Sideris, "Sidewalk informality: an examination of street vending regulation in China," *Int. Plan. Stud.*, vol. 19, no. 3–4, pp. 221–243, 2014.
- [18] M. O. G. Duque *et al.*, "Sociodemographic, environmental and labor conditions related to the presence of conjunctivitis and skin irritation in a group of informal street vendors in downtown Medellin, 2015-2019," *Rev. Bras. Med. do Trab.*, vol. 19, no. 1, p. 13, 2021.
- [19] M. A. Elsayed, A. Ashour, A. Elshater, M. A. Elfayoumi, and S. Mahmoud, "Mapping street vendors and informal economy effects in public spaces," in *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science*, IOP Publishing, 2022, p. 12043.
- [20] W. Jonga, "STREET VENDING AT MEGENAGNA (ETHIOPIA): CHALLENGES AND PROSPECTS.," *Rev. Manag. Innov. Creat.*, vol. 5, no. 15, 2012.

- [21] K. M. Ramdhan, B. Rusli, and R. A. Buchari, "PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT IN THE POLICY OF ARRANGEMENT AND EMPOWERMENT FOR STREET VENDORS IN GARUT KOTA SUBDISTRICT," *Sosiohumaniora*, vol. 22, no. 2, pp. 242–249, 2020.
- [22] I. Steiler and C. Nyirenda, "Towards sustainable livelihoods in the Tanzanian informal economy: Facilitating inclusion, organization, and rights for street vendors," WIDER Working Paper, 2021.
- [23] S. Xiong and H. Nie, "The Impact of COVID-19 on China's Market Economy".
- [24] J. Vrba, "The Path to Vietnam's Welfare System Sustainability: Current State and Challenges," *Int. J. Public Adm. Manag. Econ. Dev.*, vol. 8, no. 1, pp. 130–137, 2023.
- [25] M. Otoo, J. Fulton, G. Ibro, and J. Lowenberg-DeBoer, "Women entrepreneurship in West Africa: The cowpea street food sector in Niger and Ghana," *J. Dev. Entrep.*, vol. 16, no. 01, pp. 37–63, 2011.
- [26] A. Lyngwa and B. K. Sahoo, "COVID-19 and Street Vending in Tribal Areas: A Qualitative Analysis From Ground Zero—Aizawl, Mizoram, Northeast India," *J. Asian Afr. Stud.*, p. 00219096221143129, 2022.